California ISO
Shaping a Renewed Future
Flexible Ramping Product Technical Workshop

September 18, 2012
Lin Xu, Ph.D.
Senior Market Development Engineer
Don Tretheway
Senior Market Design and Policy Specialist

Agenda

| Time | Topic | Presenter |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $10: 00-10: 10$ | Introduction | Chris Kirsten |
| $10: 10-11: 00$ | Design Decisions | Lin Xu |
| $11: 00-12: 00$ | Modeling and Settlement <br> Examples | Lin Xu |
| $12: 00-1: 00$ | Lunch Break | Lin Xu |
| $1: 00-2: 25$ | Modeling and Settlement <br> Examples (Cont.) | Don Tretheway |
| $2: 25-2: 55$ | Cost Allocation Examples | Chris Kirsten |
| $2: 55-3: 00$ | Wrap-up and Next Steps |  |

- Design decisions
- Modeling and settlement examples
- Requirement and demand curve
- Combined IFM and RUC
- Interactions between DA, RTUC and RTD
- Settlement
- Cost allocation examples


## Design decisions in response to stakeholder comments

- Allow resource to rebid incremental flex ramp in real-time
- The ISO will assume the day-ahead FRP award has zero cost
- A resource's real-time FRP bid applies to incremental procurement from day-ahead award
- This design will prevent a resource from being paid worse off in real-time
- Regulation and flex ramp
- Model and settle flex ramp as 5-minute ramping capability
- Combined IFM and RUC
- Clarified PIRP not eligible for monthly netting if awarded FRD
- Cost allocation
- VERs can submit their own 15 minute expected energy for FRP cost allocation, but will be monitored for gaming cost allocation
- Internal self-schedules are in the supply category only
- Gross UIE will be used to allocate within the supply category

Regulation and flex ramp

- Option 1: bidding rule (ISO preferred)
- Flex ramp bid should not exceed corresponding regulation bid
- Option 2: regulation participate as flex ramp
- Pros and cons:
- Option 1: easy to implement, restricts bidding (does not seem to do any harm though)
- Option 2: difficult to implement, gives the correct incentive without restricting bidding

Modeling and Settlement Examples

- Flex ramp demand curve
- Flex ramp in day-head market
- IFM only
- Combined IFM and RUC
- Flex ramp in RTUC
- Flex ramp in RTD
- Settlement

Concept: Flex Ramp Requirement and Demand Curve


## Ramping requirement

Net system demand = load + export - import - internal self-schedules - supply deviations


Real ramping need:
Potential net load change from interval to interval t+5
(net system demand $t+5$ - net system demand $t$ )

Example: 5-minute maximum ramping need (95\% confidence interval) January to March 2012


Example: Power Balance Violation January to March 2011

| PBV <br> category | 0 MW flex ramp |  | 100 MW flex ramp |  | 200 MW flex ramp |  | 300 MW flex ramp |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Prob. | Avg. | Prob. | Avg. | Prob. | Avg. | Prob. | Avg. |
| $-200-0 \mathrm{MW}$ | $2.67 \%$ | 100.00 | $1.34 \%$ | 50.00 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| $0-100$ MW | $0.47 \%$ | 48.27 | $0.25 \%$ | 47.29 | $0.09 \%$ | 50.22 | $0.28 \%$ | 47.79 |
| $100-200$ MW | $0.25 \%$ | 147.29 | $0.09 \%$ | 150.22 | $0.28 \%$ | 147.79 | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| $200-300$ MW | $0.09 \%$ | 250.22 | $0.28 \%$ | 247.79 | $0 \%$ | 0 | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| $300-400$ MW | $0.28 \%$ | 347.79 | $0 \%$ | 0 | $0 \%$ | 0 | $0 \%$ | 0 |

Power balance violation (PBV) penalties (these values are interpolated from scheduling run parameters in the market optimization)

| Power balance violation | Penalty |
| :--- | :--- |
| $-200-0 \mathrm{MW}$ | $-\$ 150$ |
| $0-100 \mathrm{MW}$ | $\$ 1000 / \mathrm{MWh}$ |
| $100-200 \mathrm{MW}$ | $\$ 3000 / \mathrm{MWh}$ |
| $200-300 \mathrm{MW}$ | $\$ 5000 / \mathrm{MWh}$ |
| $300-400 \mathrm{MW}$ | $\$ 6500 / \mathrm{MWh}$ |

Example: Flex Ramp Demand Curve Calculation Based on PBV

| Upward | 0 MW flex ramp | 100 MW flex <br> ramp | 200 MW flex <br> ramp | 300 MW flex <br> ramp |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| PBV category | Penalty cost0 | Penalty cost100 | Penalty cost200 | Penalty cost300 |
| $0-100$ MW | 228.08 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| $100-200$ MW | 1087.06 | 116.35 | 0 | 0 |
| $200-300$ MW | 1074.77 | 387.14 | 43.14 | 0 |
| $300-400$ MW | 6355.73 | 3483.27 | 1246.51 | 134.35 |
| Sum cost | 8745.65 | 3986.76 | 1289.65 | 134.35 |
| Flex ramp value | N/A | 47.59 | 26.97 | 11.55 |


| Downward | 0 MW flex ramp | 100 MW flex <br> ramp | 200 MW flex <br> ramp | 300 MW flex <br> ramp |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| PBV category | Penalty cost0 | Penalty cost100 | Penalty cost200 | Penalty cost300 |
| $-200-0$ MW | 400.05 | 200.03 | 0 | 0 |
| Flex ramp value | N/A | 2.00 | 2.00 | 0 |

## Example: Flex Ramp Requirement and Demand Curve



California ISO

Example: IFM input

| Gen | Online | En bid | FRP bid | Reg up <br> bid | Ramp rate | Pmin | Pmax |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| G1 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 25 | 0 | N/A | 100 | 0 | 500 |
| G2 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 30 | 0 | N/A | 10 | 0 | 500 |
| G3 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 36 | 12 | 10 | 60 | 0 | 500 |

Assume the following net system demand and flex ramp requirements are going to be met by these three generators.

| Interval | Net system <br> demand | Lower <br> limit | Upper <br> limit | FRU max <br> requirement | FRD max <br> requirement |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 7:00-8:00 | 450 | n/a | n/a | 170 | 0 |
| 8:00-9:00 | 1000 | 900 | 2490 | 170 | 0 |

Upward flex ramp demand price $\$ 20$.
Assume minimum FRU requirement is 50 MW per 5 minutes based on DA forecasted net system demand.

Example: DA solution

|  | 7:00-8:00 |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Gen | En | FRU | min requirement $50 \mathrm{MW}<=$ |
| G1 | 450 | 4.17 | FRU procurement $87.5 \mathrm{MW}<=$ |
| G2 | 0 | 41.67 | max requirement 170 MW |
| G3 | 0 | 41.67 |  |
| Price | $\$ 26.67$ | $\$ 20$ | $\$ 20$ set by demand curve |

Energy price $\$ 26.67$ set by G1. G1 can provide 1 extra MW of energy with cost $\$ 20$, and reduce its FRU award by $1 / 12 \mathrm{MW}$. This will cause FRU demand reduced by $1 / 12$ MW . So the total incremental cost is $20-0 * 1 / 12+20 * 1 / 12=26.67$.
Energy and FRU are competing for capacity. The demand curve helps the optimization to decide whether the capacity should be used as energy or FRU based on the FRU marginal price. If the FRU max requirement is a hard constraint, the optimization would have produced extreme market prices.

## Example: Combined IFM and RUC Input

With IFM and RUC being combined into a single optimization, they share

- the same unit commitment decisions
- the same flex ramp and ancillary service awards.

IFM energy schedule including virtuals is based on bid-in demand, RUC capacity is based on load forecast. RUC capacity can be different from IFM energy schedule.

| Interval | Net system <br> demand | RUC Net <br> system demand | FRU max <br> requirement | FRD max <br> requirement |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 7:00-8:00 | 450 | 750 | 170 | 0 |
| 8:00-9:00 | 1050 | 1350 | 170 | 0 |

Minimum requirement (1350-750)/12=50 MW.
Assume RUC bids are zero.
Upward flex ramp demand price $\$ 20$.

Example: Combined IFM and RUC Solution

| $7: 00-8: 00$ |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Gen | En | FRU | RUC |
| G1 | 450 | 4.17 | 450 |
| G2 | 0 | 41.67 | 0 |
| G3 | 0 | 16.67 | 300 |
| Price | $\$ 25.83$ | $\$ 20$ | $\$ 0.83$ |

$\$ 20$ set by demand curve
G1 can provide 1 MW of energy and reduce $1 / 12 \mathrm{MW}$ of FRU award. G3 can make up the $1 / 12$ MW of FRU and reduce 1 MW RUC award. The incremental cost is \$25 $-0 * 1 / 12+10 * 1 / 12=25.83$. They set the energy LMP.

In order to meet RUC requirement, G3 provides 300 MW RUC schedule.
This reduces G3's FRU to 16.67 MW.

RUC price $\$ 0.83$ set by G3 and flex ramp demand.
G3 can provide 1 more MW of RUC capacity and reduce $1 / 12 \mathrm{MW}$ of FRU.
This will also reduce FRU demand by $1 / 12$ MW. The incremental cost is FRU penalty cost $1 / 12^{*} 20-1 / 12^{*} G 3$ 's regulation bid $\$ 10=\$ 0.83$. Note that regulation participated as flex ramp here.

## Example: RTUC input

| Gen | Online | En <br> bid | FRP <br> bid | Reg up <br> bid | Reg up <br> capacity | En <br> $6: 47$ | Ramp <br> rate | Pmin | Pmax |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| G1 | 6:00-10:00 | 25 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 400 | 100 | 0 | 500 |
| G2 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 30 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 0 | 10 | 0 | 500 |
| G3 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 36 | 12 | 10 | 200 | 0 | 60 | 0 | 500 |
| G4 | 7:15-9:00 | 50 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 0 | 100 | 0 | 500 |

The bid applies to incremental award from DA FRP award. DA FRP award will be assigned zero cost. For example, G1's DA FRU award is 4.17 MW. In RTUC, 4.17 MW of G1's FRU will be assigned zero cost.

| Interval | Net system <br> demand | Lower <br> limit | Upper <br> limit | FRU max <br> requirement | FRD max <br> requirement |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $7: 00-7: 15$ | 501 | n/a | n/a | 170 | 0 |
| $7: 15-7: 30$ | 801 | 651 | 1011 | 170 | 0 |

Upward flex ramp demand price \$20.

Example: RTUC Solution

|  | 7:00-7:15 |  | 7:15-7:30 |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Gen | En | FRU | En | FRU |
| G1 | 500 | 0 | 500 | 0 |
| G2 | 1 | 50 | 151 | 50 |
| G3 | 0 | 120 | 150 | 300 |
| G4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 500 |
| Price | $\$ 30$ | $\$ 10$ | $\$ 36$ | $\$ 0$ |

Set by G3's regulation bid as a result of regulation participating as flex ramp.
With regulation participating as flex ramp, if a resource is bidding flex ramp higher than regulation, the optimization will be awarded regulation based on regulation bid, but use the capacity as flex ramp. The resource will receive a flex ramp price, which is consistent with the regulation bid, but may not be consistent with the flex ramp bid.

Example: RTD1 Input

| Gen | Online | En <br> bid | FRP <br> bid | Reg up <br> bid | Reg up <br> capacity | En <br> $6: 47$ | Ramp <br> rate | Pmin | Pmax |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| G1 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 25 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 400 | 100 | 0 | 500 |
| G2 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 30 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 0 | 10 | 0 | 500 |
| G3 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 36 | 12 | 10 | 200 | 0 | 60 | 0 | 500 |
| G4 | $7: 15-9: 00$ | 50 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 0 | 100 | 0 | 500 |

The bid applies to incremental award from DA FRP award. DA FRP award will be assigned zero cost. For example, G1's DA FRU award is 4.17 MW. In RTD, 4.17 MW of G1's FRU will be assigned zero cost.

| Interval | Net system <br> demand | Lower <br> limit | Upper <br> limit | FRU <br> requirement | FRD <br> requirement |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 7:00-7:05 | 400 | n/a | n/a | 170 | 0 |
| 7:05-7:10 | 500 | 450 | 570 | 240 | 0 |
| $7: 10-7: 15$ | 600 | 550 | 740 | 310 | 0 |

Upward flex ramp demand price $\$ 20$.

Example: RTD1 Solution

|  | $7: 00-7: 05$ | $7: 05-7: 10$ | $7: 10-7: 15$ |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Gen | En | FRU | En | FRU | En | FRU |
| G1 | 302 | 198 | 352 | 148 | 402 | 98 |
| G2 | 98 | 50 | 148 | 50 | 198 | 50 |
| G3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 42 | 18 | 162 |
| G4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Price | $\$ 25$ | $\$ 0$ | $\$ 30$ | $\$ 5$ | $\$ 35$ | $\$ 10$ |

G3 has DA FRU award 41.67 MW. In RTD, 41.67 MW of G3's FRU will be assigned zero cost.
G3' RTD1 FRU award 0 MW is less than its day-ahead award 41.67 MW without energy dispatch. In this case, the FRU price for RTD1 should be zero. As a result, G3 keeps its full day-ahead payment without any real-time payback assuming it exactly follows instruction.

Example: RTD2 Input

| Gen | Online | En <br> bid | FRP <br> bid | Reg up <br> bid | Reg up <br> capacity | En <br> $6: 52$ | Ramp <br> rate | Pmin | Pmax |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| G1 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 25 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 300 | 100 | 0 | 400 |
| G2 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 30 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 100 | 10 | 0 | 500 |
| G3 | $6: 00-10: 00$ | 36 | 12 | 10 | 200 | 0 | 60 | 0 | 500 |
| G4 | $7: 15-9: 00$ | 50 | 0 | N/A | N/A | 0 | 100 | 0 | 500 |


| Interval | Net system <br> demand | Lower <br> limit | Upper <br> limit | FRU <br> requirement | FRD <br> requirement |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $7: 05-7: 10$ | 650 | n/a | n/a | 120 | 0 |
| $7: 10-7: 15$ | 750 | 600 | 770 | 190 | 0 |
| $7: 15-7: 20$ | 850 | 700 | 940 | 260 | 0 |

Flex ramp demand price $\$ 20$. Lower limit and upper limit updated.

Example: RTD2 Solution

|  | $7: 05-7: 10$ | $7: 10-7: 15$ | $7: 15-7: 20$ |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Gen | En | FRU | En | FRU | En | FRU |
| G1 | 500 | 0 | 500 | 0 | 500 | 0 |
| G2 | 150 | 50 | 200 | 50 | 250 | 50 |
| G3 | 5 | 70 | 50 | 140 | 100 | 0 |
| G4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 500 |
| Price | $\$ 36$ | $\$ 10$ | $\$ 36$ | $\$ 10$ | $\$ 36$ | $\$ 0$ |

In interval 7:05-7:10,G1 is fully dispatched for energy. It has to buy back its day-ahead FRU award at RTD price $\$ 10$. The FRU $\$ 10$ buyback price is covered by the energy profit $\$ 11$ (\$36-\$25), so the energy dispatch and RTD FRU award yields \$1/MWh net profit for G1. Generally, bidding $\$ 0$ real-time FRP cost for day-ahead award will yield non-negative overall profit for a resource in real-time.

Example: Settlement for G1

| G1 | Schedule | (MW) | Price | (\$/MWh) | IIE/UIE | (MW) |  | settlement |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Energy | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | Total |
| IFM | 450.00 | 450.00 | 25.83 | 25.83 |  |  | 968.63 | 968.63 | 1937.25 |
| RTD | 302.00 | 500.00 | 25.00 | 36.00 | -148.00 | 50.00 | -308.33 | 150.00 | -158.33 |
| Meter | 420.00 | 420.00 | 27.78 | 27.7 | 118.00 | -80.00 | 273.15 | -185.19 | 87.96 |
| Total |  | weighte | d averag | e price b | ased on | absolute |  |  | 1866.88 |

IIE = RTD energy - IFM energy
Delta FRU = RTD FRU - IFM FRU
UIE = meter - RTD energy Unavailable FRU = available FRU based on meter - RTD FRU

| G1 | Schedule | (MW) | Price | (\$/MWh) | D./U. FRU | (MW) |  | settlement | (\$) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| FRU | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | 7:00-7:05 | 7:05-7:10 | Total |
| IFM | 4.17 | 4.17 | 20.00 | 20.00 |  |  | 6.95 | 6.95 | 13.90 |
| RTD | 198.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 10.00 | 193.83 | -4.17 | 0.00 | -3.48 | -3.48 |
| Meter | 80.00 | 80.00 | 0.21 |  | -118.00 | 80.00 | -2.07 | 1.40 | -0.67 |
| Total |  | weighted | d average | price ba | ased on a | solute d | delta FRU |  | 9.76 |

- On an hourly basis, PIRP resource submits:
- Real-time self-schedule equal to $3^{\text {rd }}$ party forecast
- Maximum MW curtailment
- Ramp rate
- Energy bid price willing to be decremented
- Flexible ramping down bid price
- The ISO will use the ISO 15 minute forecast for RTUC FRP headroom and to assess availability for decremental dispatch
- If resource is dispatched or awarded FRD, the 10 minute settlement interval is not included in monthly netting


## DEC Bidding and FRD Example

| Max Curtailment (MW) | 60.0 |
| :--- | :---: |
| Ramp Rate (MW/Min) | 6 |
| Bid Price | $\$(100)$ |
| Maximum FRD Capacity (MW) | 30.0 |

## Not dispatched or awarded FRD beyond maximum curtailment

| PIRP RT Self-Schedule (MW) | Hour 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 120.0 |  |  |  | 120.0 | MWh |
|  | RTUC 1 | RTUC 2 | RTUC 3 | RTUC 4 |  |  |
| RTUC Expected Output (MW) | 50.0 | 80.0 | 120.0 | 150.0 | 100.0 | MWh |


|  | RTD 1 | RTD 2 | RTD 3 | RTD 4 | RTD 5 | RTD 6 | RTD 7 | RTD 8 | RTD 9 | RTD 10 | RTD 11 | RTD 12 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| RTD Expected Output (MW) | 50.0 | 50.0 | 50.0 | 80.0 | 80.0 | 80.0 | 120.0 | 120.0 | 120.0 | 150.0 | 150.0 | 150.0 |  |  |
| Bid Price | \$ (100) | \% (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) | \$ (100) |  |  |
| LMP | \$ (150) | \$ (50) | \$ (50) | \$ $(50)$ | \$ (150) | \$ (90) | \$ (150) | \$ (90) | \$ (150) | \$ 1150 | \$ (50) | \$ (75) |  |  |
| FRD Award (MW) | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 30.0 | 30.0 | 30.0 | 30.0 | 30.0 | 30.0 | 18.3 | MWh |
| Dispatch (MW) | 120.0 | 120.0 | 120.0 | 120.0 | 60.0 | 120.0 | 90.0 | 120.0 | 90.0 | 120.0 | 120.0 | 120.0 | 110.0 | MWh |



Resource is dispatched or awarded FRD UIE not eligible for monthly netting

15 Minute Expected Energy for Variable Energy Resources for use in Supply Category Cost Allocation

- In Master File, a variable energy resource can select:

1. Hourly PIRP self schedule (No 15 minute update)
2. ISO 15 minute forecast
3. Resource submitted 15 minute forecast

- To address gaming concerns with resource submitted forecast, ISO will analyze forecasts every six months and provide to DMM
- If resource submitted forecast systematically avoids cost allocation, this may be referred to FERC

15 minute Wind Forecast made 30 minutes prior

- Data from January 1, 2011 through May 31, 2012
- \% Deviations = (Forecast - Actual) / Forecast
- If Forecast > Actual, FRU allocation
- If Actual > Forecast, FRD allocation
- Missing data excluded


## Flexible Ramping Up (Forecast > Actual) <br> Wind 0:15 to 12:00

|  | 0:15 | 0:30 | 0:45 | 1:00 | 1:15 | 1:30 | 1:45 | 2:00 | 2:15 | 2:30 | 2:45 | 3:00 | 3:15 | 3:30 | 3:45 | 4:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 11.6\% | 10.4\% | 11.4\% | 10.9\% | 10.2\% | 11.3\% | 10.8\% | 11.1\% | 12.3\% | 11.0\% | 10.9\% | 11.3\% | 11.4\% | 11.0\% | 10.7\% | 12.0\% |
| Count Total | 258 | 213 | 216 | 251 | 261 | 255 | 257 | 260 | 257 | 277 | 264 | 258 | 270 | 294 | 287 | 281 |
| Count < 3\% | 71 | 65 | 58 | 66 | 81 | 67 | 80 | 78 | 73 | 89 | 76 | 78 | 75 | 88 | 82 | 83 |
| Max | 83.4\% | 85.4\% | 85.4\% | 84.0\% | 80.4\% | 87.5\% | 88.0\% | 85.9\% | 86.4\% | 88.7\% | 88.5\% | 89.2\% | 89.9\% | 92.1\% | 88.5\% | 94.5\% |
| Min | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 13.9\% | 13.3\% | 13.1\% | 13.3\% | 12.4\% | 12.9\% | 12.9\% | 13.4\% | 14.6\% | 14.8\% | 14.1\% | 15.2\% | 15.1\% | 14.2\% | 14.1\% | 15.9\% |
|  | 4:15 | 4:30 | 4:45 | 5:00 | 5:15 | 5:30 | 5:45 | 6:00 | 6:15 | 6:30 | 6:45 | 7:00 | 7:15 | 7:30 | 7:45 | 8:00 |
| Average | 13.5\% | 11.9\% | 11.7\% | 13.7\% | 13.0\% | 12.8\% | 13.5\% | 13.6\% | 13.9\% | 12.8\% | 12.3\% | 13.8\% | 14.2\% | 13.8\% | 12.7\% | 13.2\% |
| Count Total | 278 | 286 | 279 | 268 | 267 | 243 | 256 | 277 | 269 | 287 | 284 | 274 | 269 | 259 | 273 | 268 |
| Count < 3\% | 60 | 78 | 69 | 65 | 64 | 48 | 52 | 61 | 59 | 65 | 61 | 55 | 51 | 44 | 57 | 47 |
| Max | 96.4\% | 93.9\% | 93.0\% | 94.6\% | 96.6\% | 94.9\% | 93.5\% | 93.1\% | 94.1\% | 93.6\% | 93.3\% | 94.2\% | 92.8\% | 91.1\% | 89.0\% | 91.5\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 16.4\% | 14.2\% | 14.3\% | 17.3\% | 16.6\% | 15.2\% | 15.7\% | 16.8\% | 17.3\% | 15.2\% | 14.6\% | 16.2\% | 15.6\% | 13.8\% | 13.4\% | 13.6\% |
|  | 8:15 | 8:30 | 8:45 | 9:00 | 9:15 | 9:30 | 9:45 | 10:00 | 10:15 | 10:30 | 10:45 | 11:00 | 11:15 | 11:30 | 11:45 | 12:00 |
| Average | 13.1\% | 14.0\% | 14.3\% | 15.6\% | 15.8\% | 15.4\% | 15.1\% | 15.1\% | 13.9\% | 14.7\% | 14.4\% | 14.8\% | 15.0\% | 13.7\% | 14.6\% | 15.5\% |
| Count Total | 282 | 272 | 284 | 285 | 274 | 299 | 286 | 278 | 288 | 282 | 273 | 273 | 278 | 264 | 248 | 255 |
| Count < 3\% | 63 | 46 | 55 | 49 | 38 | 54 | 44 | 42 | 50 | 41 | 53 | 48 | 51 | 53 | 37 | 36 |
| Max | 91.1\% | 88.4\% | 87.9\% | 87.3\% | 90.1\% | 88.9\% | 86.7\% | 84.7\% | 83.9\% | 88.8\% | 91.0\% | 94.1\% | 93.2\% | 92.3\% | 85.6\% | 89.9\% |
| Min | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 14.4\% | 14.3\% | 14.4\% | 15.4\% | 14.5\% | 14.5\% | 14.7\% | 15.1\% | 13.4\% | 14.2\% | 14.4\% | 14.5\% | 14.9\% | 13.8\% | 13.5\% | 14.6\% |

## Flexible Ramping Up (Forecast > Actual) <br> Wind 12:00 to 24:00

|  | 12:15 | 12:30 | 12:45 | 13:00 | 13:15 | 13:30 | 13:45 | 14:00 | 14:15 | 14:30 | 14:45 | 15:00 | 15:15 | 15:30 | 15:45 | 16:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 16.5\% | 16.5\% | 16.2\% | 16.8\% | 18.3\% | 18.2\% | 17.3\% | 16.4\% | 16.6\% | 17.2\% | 17.0\% | 16.3\% | 15.9\% | 17.4\% | 18.7\% | 17.1\% |
| Count Total | 254 | 269 | 279 | 257 | 260 | 269 | 263 | 257 | 242 | 247 | 245 | 243 | 226 | 233 | 230 | 267 |
| Count < 3\% | 43 | 51 | 54 | 52 | 42 | 46 | 60 | 53 | 43 | 45 | 43 | 57 | 42 | 40 | 40 | 54 |
| Max | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 85.8\% | 100.0\% | 88.7\% | 98.2\% | 92.7\% | 85.3\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 16.5\% | 16.5\% | 16.9\% | 15.9\% | 17.1\% | 17.9\% | 17.9\% | 16.8\% | 16.5\% | 17.8\% | 17.8\% | 17.7\% | 17.6\% | 18.4\% | 19.2\% | 18.5\% |
|  | 16:15 | 16:30 | 16:45 | 17:00 | 17:15 | 17:30 | 17:45 | 18:00 | 18:15 | 18:30 | 18:45 | 19:00 | 19:15 | 19:30 | 19:45 | 20:00 |
| Average | 16.4\% | 14.9\% | 14.8\% | 17.0\% | 16.7\% | 15.1\% | 13.7\% | 13.9\% | 13.3\% | 13.7\% | 13.6\% | 14.1\% | 13.6\% | 12.4\% | 12.3\% | 12.8\% |
| Count Total | 257 | 254 | 255 | 239 | 242 | 240 | 253 | 249 | 256 | 248 | 243 | 267 | 262 | 258 | 252 | 251 |
| Count < 3\% | 59 | 60 | 59 | 47 | 56 | 53 | 55 | 62 | 70 | 62 | 59 | 67 | 68 | 65 | 63 | 66 |
| Max | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% |
| SDev | 18.4\% | 17.7\% | 17.3\% | 17.9\% | 17.8\% | 17.1\% | 16.3\% | 16.4\% | 16.7\% | 16.2\% | 16.0\% | 17.0\% | 16.5\% | 14.9\% | 14.9\% | 15.7\% |
|  | 20:15 | 20:30 | 20:45 | 21:00 | 21:15 | 21:30 | 21:45 | 22:00 | 22:15 | 22:30 | 22:45 | 23:00 | 23:15 | 23:30 | 23:45 | 0:00 |
| Average | 12.5\% | 12.9\% | 12.4\% | 11.6\% | 12.3\% | 11.0\% | 10.3\% | 10.9\% | 11.4\% | 11.1\% | 10.6\% | 9.7\% | 9.7\% | 11.2\% | 11.1\% | 10.1\% |
| Count Total | 243 | 257 | 231 | 216 | 232 | 254 | 244 | 226 | 203 | 228 | 238 | 246 | 252 | 246 | 244 | 258 |
| Count < 3\% | 67 | 57 | 58 | 59 | 57 | 63 | 67 | 67 | 46 | 56 | 62 | 65 | 71 | 64 | 67 | 88 |
| Max | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 100.0\% | 86.8\% | 87.1\% | 86.5\% | 86.1\% | 83.7\% | 82.9\% | 82.7\% | 81.9\% | 83.7\% | 83.2\% | 82.3\% | 81.8\% | 80.3\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 15.8\% | 15.5\% | 15.1\% | 14.3\% | 14.2\% | 12.7\% | 12.5\% | 12.8\% | 13.0\% | 12.6\% | 12.4\% | 11.9\% | 12.1\% | 13.0\% | 12.9\% | 12.5\% |

## Flexible Ramping Down (Actual > Forecast) <br> Wind 0:15 to 12:00

|  | 0:15 | 0:30 | 0:45 | 1:00 | 1:15 | 1:30 | 1:45 | 2:00 | 2:15 | 2:30 | 2:45 | 3:00 | 3:15 | 3:30 | 3:45 | 4:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 13.4\% | 16.7\% | 22.0\% | 16.6\% | 15.3\% | 12.0\% | 11.4\% | 12.3\% | 16.4\% | 12.4\% | 12.4\% | 11.4\% | 12.1\% | 12.0\% | 13.7\% | 13.7\% |
| Count Total | 246 | 205 | 265 | 237 | 235 | 242 | 240 | 240 | 244 | 215 | 231 | 234 | 227 | 205 | 218 | 221 |
| Count < 3\% | 76 | 43 | 71 | 69 | 61 | 71 | 79 | 68 | 74 | 77 | 81 | 73 | 65 | 60 | 61 | 74 |
| Max | 117.9\% | 172.5\% | 150.9\% | 111.8\% | 151.0\% | 151.6\% | 130.9\% | 94.7\% | 200.6\% | 105.6\% | 234.2\% | 110.6\% | 197.0\% | 133.7\% | 129.2\% | 122.0\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 20.3\% | 23.1\% | 30.7\% | 23.4\% | 23.6\% | 18.1\% | 17.9\% | 14.5\% | 26.2\% | 17.4\% | 21.9\% | 15.3\% | 18.7\% | 17.0\% | 21.0\% | 20.9\% |
|  | 4:15 | 4:30 | 4:45 | 5:00 | 5:15 | 5:30 | 5:45 | 6:00 | 6:15 | 6:30 | 6:45 | 7:00 | 7:15 | 7:30 | 7:45 | 8:00 |
| Average | 15.5\% | 13.5\% | 15.8\% | 14.3\% | 18.3\% | 13.7\% | 17.1\% | 15.2\% | 14.2\% | 13.6\% | 17.3\% | 13.2\% | 12.2\% | 13.4\% | 14.8\% | 18.5\% |
| Count Total | 226 | 218 | 228 | 236 | 240 | 230 | 248 | 224 | 237 | 217 | 223 | 230 | 238 | 247 | 232 | 236 |
| Count < 3\% | 74 | 61 | 59 | 71 | 68 | 64 | 68 | 70 | 62 | 61 | 49 | 69 | 70 | 68 | 55 | 43 |
| Max | 128.4\% | 233.6\% | 203.5\% | 180.2\% | 521.7\% | 164.6\% | 151.4\% | 179.8\% | 129.5\% | 105.2\% | 196.1\% | 176.4\% | 209.0\% | 247.4\% | 290.6\% | 213.0\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 23.1\% | 22.9\% | 25.3\% | 23.5\% | 42.0\% | 22.0\% | 23.9\% | 26.0\% | 20.5\% | 18.2\% | 25.7\% | 20.5\% | 20.0\% | 22.9\% | 26.1\% | 26.9\% |
|  | 8:15 | 8:30 | 8:45 | 9:00 | 9:15 | 9:30 | 9:45 | 10:00 | 10:15 | 10:30 | 10:45 | 11:00 | 11:15 | 11:30 | 11:45 | 12:00 |
| Average | 17.8\% | 15.1\% | 15.2\% | 14.4\% | 16.3\% | 19.1\% | 20.3\% | 25.9\% | 22.2\% | 21.8\% | 20.5\% | 20.0\% | 22.4\% | 20.5\% | 21.6\% | 28.9\% |
| Count Total | 225 | 234 | 224 | 221 | 232 | 204 | 220 | 227 | 218 | 225 | 234 | 232 | 228 | 243 | 264 | 251 |
| Count < 3\% | 45 | 45 | 47 | 44 | 58 | 46 | 51 | 39 | 41 | 46 | 41 | 45 | 52 | 45 | 53 | 56 |
| Max | 217.6\% | 232.0\% | 270.7\% | 271.1\% | 314.3\% | 359.8\% | 384.1\% | 770.5\% | 406.3\% | 436.4\% | 436.7\% | 367.5\% | 472.0\% | 384.4\% | 559.6\% | 1879.2\% |
| Min | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 26.7\% | 21.1\% | 23.7\% | 22.9\% | 27.7\% | 32.7\% | 40.0\% | 66.5\% | 37.5\% | 41.1\% | 37.0\% | 32.8\% | 46.3\% | 40.8\% | 48.6\% | 126.0\% |

## Flexible Ramping Down (Actual > Forecast) <br> Wind 12:00 to 24:00

|  | 12:15 | 12:30 | 12:45 | 13:00 | 13:15 | 13:30 | 13:45 | 14:00 | 14:15 | 14:30 | 14:45 | 15:00 | 15:15 | 15:30 | 15:45 | 16:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 27.4\% | 21.7\% | 54.1\% | 20.9\% | 20.1\% | 18.3\% | 17.9\% | 21.7\% | 21.8\% | 20.5\% | 21.2\% | 23.3\% | 22.5\% | 30.4\% | 26.5\% | 26.2\% |
| Count Total | 255 | 241 | 232 | 250 | 251 | 241 | 246 | 249 | 264 | 261 | 265 | 259 | 281 | 276 | 277 | 244 |
| Count < 3\% | 50 | 57 | 46 | 55 | 74 | 50 | 56 | 49 | 54 | 51 | 58 | 54 | 61 | 61 | 61 | 43 |
| Max | 1773.1\% | 1369.9\% | 5772.2\% | 446.2\% | 430.4\% | 440.2\% | 398.4\% | 365.1\% | 392.6\% | 383.6\% | 388.5\% | 758.7\% | 583.9\% | 1276.0\% | 1080.4\% | 888.6\% |
| Min | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 117.5\% | 93.1\% | 404.0\% | 41.5\% | 38.9\% | 38.5\% | 40.1\% | 45.6\% | 43.2\% | 40.9\% | 39.7\% | 57.9\% | 47.2\% | 111.4\% | 84.3\% | 78.9\% |
|  | 16:15 | 16:30 | 16:45 | 17:00 | 17:15 | 17:30 | 17:45 | 18:00 | 18:15 | 18:30 | 18:45 | 19:00 | 19:15 | 19:30 | 19:45 | 20:00 |
| Average | 24.6\% | 17.3\% | 19.1\% | 22.2\% | 22.6\% | 18.7\% | 17.3\% | 21.0\% | 27.4\% | 20.4\% | 19.0\% | 16.9\% | 17.9\% | 16.2\% | 18.3\% | 16.9\% |
| Count Total | 251 | 253 | 255 | 266 | 266 | 267 | 257 | 256 | 251 | 256 | 266 | 242 | 246 | 252 | 257 | 254 |
| Count < 3\% | 57 | 56 | 55 | 74 | 54 | 63 | 69 | 73 | 57 | 74 | 73 | 58 | 63 | 67 | 68 | 75 |
| Max | 988.5\% | 488.3\% | 682.9\% | 1242.5\% | 973.7\% | 935.2\% | 570.3\% | 788.7\% | 898.9\% | 856.2\% | 621.7\% | 631.8\% | 574.7\% | 380.1\% | 547.6\% | 874.1\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 72.8\% | 36.9\% | 48.0\% | 83.0\% | 65.7\% | 60.8\% | 41.3\% | 56.6\% | 75.7\% | 63.7\% | 48.8\% | 45.3\% | 45.2\% | 33.4\% | 42.2\% | 61.0\% |
|  | 20:15 | 20:30 | 20:45 | 21:00 | 21:15 | 21:30 | 21:45 | 22:00 | 22:15 | 22:30 | 22:45 | 23:00 | 23:15 | 23:30 | 23:45 | 0:00 |
| Average | 17.7\% | 12.8\% | 14.7\% | 17.9\% | 19.6\% | 15.3\% | 15.2\% | 11.9\% | 14.3\% | 12.4\% | 26.1\% | 13.2\% | 17.3\% | 12.2\% | 11.6\% | 11.7\% |
| Count Total | 264 | 246 | 273 | 266 | 268 | 249 | 265 | 276 | 305 | 225 | 267 | 255 | 255 | 258 | 258 | 241 |
| Count < 3\% | 77 | 73 | 81 | 69 | 81 | 63 | 77 | 86 | 82 | 72 | 44 | 71 | 59 | 91 | 77 | 68 |
| Max | 851.3\% | 477.4\% | 625.1\% | 685.5\% | 439.9\% | 456.8\% | 593.9\% | 206.5\% | 164.9\% | 180.3\% | 329.1\% | 168.8\% | 159.4\% | 140.7\% | 107.6\% | 99.4\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 60.3\% | 33.5\% | 43.3\% | 63.7\% | 37.7\% | 33.9\% | 42.6\% | 19.5\% | 22.3\% | 22.8\% | 37.1\% | 21.7\% | 26.0\% | 19.4\% | 17.3\% | 17.0\% |

15 minute Solar Forecast made 60 minutes prior

- Data from January 19, 2012 through September 10, 2012
- \% Deviations = (Forecast - Actual) / Forecast
- If Forecast > Actual, FRU allocation
- If Actual > Forecast, FRD allocation
- Missing data excluded


## Flexible Ramping Up (Forecast > Actual) <br> Solar 0:15 to 12:00

|  | 0:15 | 0:30 | 0:45 | 1:00 | 1:15 | 1:30 | 1:45 | 2:00 | 2:15 | 2:30 | 2:45 | 3:00 | 3:15 | 3:30 | 3:45 | 4:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 45.1\% | 46.2\% | 46.4\% | 45.4\% | 45.8\% | 45.4\% | 45.3\% | 45.5\% | 44.9\% | 46.2\% | 45.3\% | 43.9\% | 44.8\% | 45.1\% | 45.0\% | 43.5\% |
| Count Total | 151 | 150 | 146 | 148 | 149 | 148 | 149 | 147 | 147 | 145 | 143 | 143 | 142 | 142 | 144 | 148 |
| Count < 3\% | 5 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 6 |
| Max | 95.3\% | 93.6\% | 91.8\% | 91.9\% | 92.9\% | 92.3\% | 92.4\% | 92.0\% | 91.9\% | 90.9\% | 91.1\% | 90.5\% | 90.6\% | 90.7\% | 91.7\% | 92.3\% |
| Min | 0.4\% | 0.4\% | 1.7\% | 0.2\% | 0.8\% | 0.7\% | 0.3\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.6\% | 1.9\% | 2.6\% | 3.2\% | 1.9\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 26.2\% | 25.8\% | 25.4\% | 25.2\% | 25.4\% | 25.5\% | 25.7\% | 25.9\% | 26.0\% | 25.2\% | 25.0\% | 25.5\% | 25.3\% | 25.3\% | 25.7\% | 26.2\% |
|  | 4:15 | 4:30 | 4:45 | 5:00 | 5:15 | 5:30 | 5:45 | 6:00 | 6:15 | 6:30 | 6:45 | 7:00 | 7:15 | 7:30 | 7:45 | 8:00 |
| Average | 43.6\% | 43.3\% | 44.6\% | 44.5\% | 44.9\% | 44.0\% | 44.8\% | 32.0\% | 23.1\% | 23.4\% | 21.3\% | 9.8\% | 9.4\% | 10.2\% | 10.5\% | 9.6\% |
| Count Total | 148 | 149 | 148 | 148 | 146 | 149 | 145 | 147 | 121 | 122 | 126 | 186 | 185 | 154 | 153 | 134 |
| Count < 3\% | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 7 | 17 | 24 | 24 | 61 | 60 | 55 | 53 | 43 |
| Max | 94.2\% | 93.4\% | 95.1\% | 94.2\% | 92.8\% | 90.7\% | 90.7\% | 89.1\% | 90.1\% | 84.9\% | 86.7\% | 87.0\% | 82.8\% | 90.5\% | 89.3\% | 54.4\% |
| Min | 0.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.9\% | 0.8\% | 0.1\% | 0.8\% | 0.6\% | 0.4\% | 0.6\% | 0.4\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.4\% |
| SDev | 26.2\% | 26.4\% | 26.6\% | 26.2\% | 25.8\% | 26.2\% | 25.6\% | 24.9\% | 23.6\% | 24.2\% | 22.9\% | 15.2\% | 14.1\% | 13.9\% | 12.5\% | 9.8\% |
|  | 8:15 | 8:30 | 8:45 | 9:00 | 9:15 | 9:30 | 9:45 | 10:00 | 10:15 | 10:30 | 10:45 | 11:00 | 11:15 | 11:30 | 11:45 | 12:00 |
| Average | 8.8\% | 8.4\% | 8.4\% | 8.0\% | 7.7\% | 7.0\% | 6.7\% | 6.8\% | 6.4\% | 6.2\% | 5.5\% | 5.1\% | 4.9\% | 4.6\% | 4.6\% | 4.5\% |
| Count Total | 126 | 129 | 122 | 121 | 118 | 116 | 109 | 103 | 100 | 101 | 99 | 105 | 104 | 107 | 109 | 115 |
| Count < 3\% | 50 | 45 | 48 | 50 | 51 | 52 | 51 | 47 | 44 | 47 | 48 | 54 | 52 | 56 | 56 | 62 |
| Max | 56.0\% | 52.7\% | 36.9\% | 50.3\% | 67.5\% | 69.5\% | 61.9\% | 60.0\% | 55.2\% | 53.4\% | 49.2\% | 45.5\% | 43.3\% | 38.2\% | 34.8\% | 32.3\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 10.2\% | 9.1\% | 8.9\% | 8.9\% | 9.2\% | 9.1\% | 8.3\% | 8.3\% | 7.8\% | 7.8\% | 7.0\% | 6.3\% | 6.1\% | 5.6\% | 5.3\% | 5.1\% |

## Flexible Ramping Up (Forecast > Actual) <br> Solar 12:00 to 24:00

|  | 12:15 | 12:30 | 12:45 | 13:00 | 13:15 | 13:30 | 13:45 | 14:00 | 14:15 | 14:30 | 14:45 | 15:00 | 15:15 | 15:30 | 15:45 | 16:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 4.0\% | 4.3\% | 4.4\% | 4.4\% | 4.6\% | 5.0\% | 5.3\% | 5.0\% | 5.6\% | 6.0\% | 6.1\% | 5.7\% | 6.0\% | 5.7\% | 5.8\% | 5.5\% |
| Count Total | 123 | 114 | 115 | 110 | 103 | 95 | 84 | 96 | 96 | 99 | 101 | 100 | 100 | 116 | 108 | 116 |
| Count < 3\% | 71 | 61 | 62 | 58 | 54 | 45 | 39 | 48 | 41 | 42 | 42 | 43 | 38 | 52 | 48 | 57 |
| Max | 30.7\% | 31.1\% | 29.9\% | 25.7\% | 23.9\% | 25.3\% | 24.8\% | 24.5\% | 26.8\% | 31.3\% | 36.4\% | 38.5\% | 38.8\% | 35.4\% | 32.6\% | 29.0\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 4.7\% | 4.8\% | 5.0\% | 4.9\% | 5.1\% | 5.3\% | 5.2\% | 5.1\% | 5.5\% | 6.1\% | 6.6\% | 6.5\% | 6.4\% | 6.3\% | 6.3\% | 6.3\% |
|  | 16:15 | 16:30 | 16:45 | 17:00 | 17:15 | 17:30 | 17:45 | 18:00 | 18:15 | 18:30 | 18:45 | 19:00 | 19:15 | 19:30 | 19:45 | 20:00 |
| Average | 6.1\% | 6.1\% | 6.1\% | 7.1\% | 7.4\% | 8.2\% | 8.8\% | 9.2\% | 9.1\% | 9.1\% | 9.6\% | 9.9\% | 11.3\% | 12.7\% | 12.6\% | 13.1\% |
| Count Total | 107 | 123 | 119 | 108 | 118 | 122 | 123 | 116 | 115 | 109 | 109 | 108 | 99 | 96 | 100 | 101 |
| Count < 3\% | 48 | 61 | 62 | 51 | 56 | 55 | 52 | 53 | 57 | 54 | 49 | 46 | 33 | 32 | 32 | 28 |
| Max | 31.6\% | 34.8\% | 51.6\% | 63.7\% | 56.9\% | 51.2\% | 74.1\% | 80.1\% | 83.9\% | 84.5\% | 79.2\% | 83.6\% | 92.3\% | 92.5\% | 79.8\% | 85.6\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.5\% | 0.1\% | 0.2\% |
| SDev | 6.9\% | 7.1\% | 7.8\% | 9.3\% | 9.3\% | 10.0\% | 11.8\% | 13.2\% | 13.7\% | 14.4\% | 14.0\% | 13.8\% | 15.4\% | 17.3\% | 16.7\% | 17.8\% |
|  | 20:15 | 20:30 | 20:45 | 21:00 | 21:15 | 21:30 | 21:45 | 22:00 | 22:15 | 22:30 | 22:45 | 23:00 | 23:15 | 23:30 | 23:45 | 0:00 |
| Average | 13.1\% | 14.0\% | 14.6\% | 20.1\% | 35.3\% | 33.6\% | 33.2\% | 29.3\% | 30.5\% | 31.2\% | 32.3\% | 31.5\% | 43.0\% | 47.2\% | 44.7\% | 50.9\% |
| Count Total | 101 | 100 | 106 | 107 | 106 | 107 | 112 | 118 | 110 | 108 | 107 | 111 | 122 | 136 | 140 | 136 |
| Count < 3\% | 25 | 26 | 22 | 21 | 19 | 24 | 25 | 26 | 23 | 21 | 22 | 18 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 1 |
| Max | 80.4\% | 93.3\% | 93.6\% | 99.4\% | 99.7\% | 99.7\% | 100.0\% | 99.9\% | 99.8\% | 99.8\% | 99.4\% | 98.9\% | 99.1\% | 98.6\% | 96.9\% | 96.8\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.3\% | 0.3\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 1.0\% | 0.5\% | 0.1\% | 1.1\% |
| SDev | 16.0\% | 17.7\% | 18.1\% | 22.3\% | 34.7\% | 33.7\% | 34.8\% | 31.7\% | 31.7\% | 32.2\% | 32.2\% | 29.9\% | 26.9\% | 26.5\% | 25.3\% | 23.6\% |

## Flexible Ramping Down (Actual > Forecast) <br> Solar 0:15 to 12:00

|  | 0:15 | 0:30 | 0:45 | 1:00 | 1:15 | 1:30 | 1:45 | 2:00 | 2:15 | 2:30 | 2:45 | 3:00 | 3:15 | 3:30 | 3:45 | 4:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 197.9\% | 217.9\% | 202.8\% | 217.8\% | 226.2\% | 215.1\% | 213.0\% | 193.7\% | 199.4\% | 194.8\% | 190.6\% | 195.1\% | 189.7\% | 186.2\% | 191.5\% | 205.4\% |
| Count Total | 81 | 82 | 86 | 84 | 83 | 84 | 83 | 85 | 85 | 87 | 89 | 89 | 90 | 90 | 88 | 84 |
| Count < 3\% | 1 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 6 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 0 |
| Max | 3271.9\% | 3431.1\% | 3426.4\% | 3743.9\% | 3800.9\% | 3740.3\% | 3825.2\% | 3834.5\% | 3896.8\% | 3533.7\% | 3706.3\% | 3797.1\% | 3918.2\% | 4029.7\% | 4038.5\% | 4556.3\% |
| Min | 0.5\% | 2.7\% | 0.5\% | 3.8\% | 3.4\% | 2.6\% | 0.5\% | 1.1\% | 1.4\% | 0.8\% | 0.6\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.5\% | 3.5\% |
| SDev | 408.8\% | 468.4\% | 428.4\% | 474.4\% | 474.6\% | 463.8\% | 471.4\% | 455.6\% | 463.7\% | 435.5\% | 449.5\% | 459.2\% | 466.6\% | 470.1\% | 475.0\% | 534.6\% |
|  | 4:15 | 4:30 | 4:45 | 5:00 | 5:15 | 5:30 | 5:45 | 6:00 | 6:15 | 6:30 | 6:45 | 7:00 | 7:15 | 7:30 | 7:45 | 8:00 |
| Average | 201.8\% | 198.9\% | 197.7\% | 166.5\% | 159.2\% | 168.9\% | 156.6\% | 54.3\% | 79.7\% | 71.4\% | 20.2\% | 7.5\% | 5.9\% | 7.7\% | 7.9\% | 7.5\% |
| Count Total | 84 | 83 | 84 | 84 | 86 | 83 | 87 | 85 | 111 | 110 | 106 | 46 | 47 | 78 | 79 | 98 |
| Count < 3\% | 3 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 5 | 6 | 22 | 15 | 25 | 19 | 23 | 36 | 38 | 50 |
| Max | 4384.9\% | 4495.4\% | 4619.6\% | 1916.3\% | 1558.4\% | 1605.1\% | 1480.9\% | 617.6\% | 3694.2\% | 1971.5\% | 285.2\% | 64.2\% | 25.2\% | 145.3\% | 126.8\% | 114.5\% |
| Min | 0.5\% | 1.0\% | 0.8\% | 0.6\% | 0.1\% | 2.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.3\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 517.8\% | 525.3\% | 538.3\% | 299.7\% | 277.3\% | 285.4\% | 268.4\% | 84.0\% | 362.2\% | 220.5\% | 35.0\% | 10.9\% | 6.7\% | 17.3\% | 15.7\% | 14.6\% |
|  | 8:15 | 8:30 | 8:45 | 9:00 | 9:15 | 9:30 | 9:45 | 10:00 | 10:15 | 10:30 | 10:45 | 11:00 | 11:15 | 11:30 | 11:45 | 12:00 |
| Average | 9.2\% | 10.6\% | 10.9\% | 11.5\% | 10.9\% | 11.4\% | 10.7\% | 10.2\% | 9.8\% | 9.2\% | 8.2\% | 7.4\% | 6.7\% | 6.5\% | 6.0\% | 6.2\% |
| Count Total | 106 | 103 | 110 | 111 | 114 | 116 | 123 | 129 | 132 | 131 | 133 | 127 | 128 | 125 | 123 | 117 |
| Count < 3\% | 43 | 37 | 40 | 42 | 44 | 45 | 48 | 52 | 53 | 51 | 53 | 57 | 60 | 60 | 64 | 56 |
| Max | 112.9\% | 94.8\% | 59.6\% | 92.6\% | 90.9\% | 103.8\% | 102.6\% | 99.0\% | 91.7\% | 80.9\% | 62.0\% | 44.6\% | 41.0\% | 43.3\% | 34.1\% | 37.8\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% |
| SDev | 14.7\% | 14.1\% | 13.7\% | 15.4\% | 14.4\% | 16.4\% | 16.7\% | 15.6\% | 14.5\% | 13.2\% | 10.2\% | 8.9\% | 7.9\% | 7.9\% | 7.4\% | 7.3\% |

## Flexible Ramping Down (Actual > Forecast) Solar 12:00 to 24:00

|  | 12:15 | 12:30 | 12:45 | 13:00 | 13:15 | 13:30 | 13:45 | 14:00 | 14:15 | 14:30 | 14:45 | 15:00 | 15:15 | 15:30 | 15:45 | 16:00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | 6.4\% | 6.2\% | 7.5\% | 7.8\% | 8.1\% | 8.2\% | 7.9\% | 8.7\% | 8.9\% | 9.3\% | 9.8\% | 10.4\% | 10.5\% | 11.9\% | 12.1\% | 13.5\% |
| Count Total | 109 | 118 | 117 | 122 | 129 | 137 | 148 | 136 | 136 | 133 | 131 | 132 | 132 | 116 | 124 | 116 |
| Count < 3\% | 49 | 54 | 51 | 54 | 58 | 63 | 71 | 61 | 67 | 69 | 63 | 61 | 64 | 48 | 57 | 47 |
| Max | 33.8\% | 35.9\% | 49.5\% | 53.6\% | 53.7\% | 64.0\% | 61.0\% | 61.5\% | 62.2\% | 71.2\% | 73.9\% | 86.2\% | 90.8\% | 82.3\% | 84.0\% | 84.1\% |
| Min | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 7.0\% | 7.2\% | 9.5\% | 10.2\% | 11.2\% | 11.9\% | 11.4\% | 12.4\% | 13.1\% | 13.7\% | 14.0\% | 15.0\% | 15.6\% | 16.7\% | 17.5\% | 19.0\% |
|  | 16:15 | 16:30 | 16:45 | 17:00 | 17:15 | 17:30 | 17:45 | 18:00 | 18:15 | 18:30 | 18:45 | 19:00 | 19:15 | 19:30 | 19:45 | 20:00 |
| Average | 13.3\% | 17.3\% | 19.9\% | 18.3\% | 19.6\% | 21.7\% | 18.5\% | 16.9\% | 20.7\% | 22.1\% | 25.7\% | 32.5\% | 49.5\% | 615.8\% | 917.8\% | 210.0\% |
| Count Total | 125 | 109 | 113 | 124 | 114 | 110 | 109 | 116 | 117 | 123 | 123 | 124 | 133 | 136 | 132 | 131 |
| Count < 3\% | 54 | 40 | 38 | 44 | 37 | 41 | 39 | 41 | 34 | 36 | 39 | 35 | 37 | 35 | 34 | 31 |
| Max | 136.0\% | 221.2\% | 335.2\% | 323.6\% | 263.6\% | 341.8\% | 267.2\% | 238.4\% | 364.3\% | 412.5\% | 300.8\% | 435.7\% | 1763.9\% | 75496.1\% | \#\#\#\#\#\#\#\# | 12433.5\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% |
| SDev | 20.9\% | 29.2\% | 41.1\% | 38.0\% | 36.9\% | 46.2\% | 32.8\% | 29.9\% | 45.2\% | 46.5\% | 46.3\% | 62.7\% | 170.9\% | 6475.3\% | 9675.3\% | 1242.9\% |
|  | 20:15 | 20:30 | 20:45 | 21:00 | 21:15 | 21:30 | 21:45 | 22:00 | 22:15 | 22:30 | 22:45 | 23:00 | 23:15 | 23:30 | 23:45 | 0:00 |
| Average | 979.8\% | 1359.0\% | 1770.6\% | 1468.2\% | 1228.8\% | 1400.8\% | 1459.5\% | 1553.3\% | 1147.7\% | 2373.6\% | 1891.2\% | 1164.5\% | 140.5\% | 186.5\% | 172.6\% | 151.8\% |
| Count Total | 131 | 132 | 126 | 125 | 126 | 125 | 120 | 114 | 122 | 124 | 125 | 121 | 110 | 96 | 92 | 96 |
| Count < 3\% | 33 | 32 | 28 | 21 | 15 | 19 | 18 | 11 | 19 | 21 | 17 | 14 | 7 | 6 | 2 | 4 |
| Max | 55675.7\% | 78622.4\% | 76863.0\% | 43155.9\% | 35407.2\% | 45547.1\% | 55429.4\% | 58383.7\% | 44812.0\% | \#\#\#\#\#\#\#\# | \#\#\#\#\#\#\#\# | 59170.7\% | 2343.9\% | 2613.3\% | 2084.9\% | 1959.1\% |
| Min | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.4\% | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% | 0.1\% | 0.7\% | 0.2\% | 1.9\% | 0.3\% |
| SDev | 6089.6\% | 8780.2\% | 9888.7\% | 6022.5\% | 4338.7\% | 5222.5\% | 5863.3\% | 6317.5\% | 4826.4\% | 15214.1\% | 13049.1\% | 5800.4\% | 273.3\% | 367.0\% | 308.6\% | 285.9\% |

Movement (initial allocation) for supply category includes internal self-schedules

- Variable energy resource, then delta UIE
- If an internal resource is dispatched, then delta UIE
- If an internal resource has a self-schedule and has been dispatch above self-schedule, then delta UIE and delta self schedule
- If an internal resource has a self-schedule and has not been dispatched above self schedule, then delta "meter"

Common movement metric used to divide total costs in to three categories

| 1 | Load |  | Metric | Meter |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2 | Variable Energy <br> Resource | Net Across LSEs | Change in 10 Min <br> Observed Load | Hourly |
|  | Internal Generation | Net Across all <br> Supply | Change in 10 Min UIE | (10 Minute |
|  | Internal Self Schedules |  | Change in 10 Min <br> Ramp |  |
| 3 | Fixed Ramp - Static <br> Interties | Net Across all SCs <br> 20 Minute Ramp <br> Modeled | 10 Min change in MWh <br> deemed delivered | None |

Note: Supply threshold not used in allocation to category

Difficulty with using deltas to allocate within supply category

- Initial allocation to the supply category based on common movement metric
- Utilizing existing settlement charge codes within category greatly simplifies design for both ISO and market participants
- Can be argued that gross UIE provides greater clarity to incentivize behavior
- Not allocated a cost for returning to schedule

Allocation within the supply category

- VER, then gross deviation from 15 minute profile
- No self schedule, then gross UIE
- Self-schedule and dispatched in RTD, then gross UIE
- Self-schedule and not dispatched, then gross honored ramp
- Standard Ramping Energy + Ramping Energy Deviation + Residual Imbalance Energy + UIE 1 + UIE 2
- Threshold applies to all above
- Minimum of $3 \%$ of instruction or 0.83 MWh (5MW/6)


## Allocation of each pie slice

|  |  | Baseline | Actual | Deviation | Allocation |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Load | Day-Ahead Schedule | Metered Demand | UIE | Gross Deviation |
|  | Variable Energy Resource | 15 Minute Expected Energy | 10 Minute Meter | Baseline Actual | Gross Deviation Outside Threshold |
| 2 | Generation with Instructed Energy | Instruction | 10 Minute Meter | UIE1 + UIE2 | Gross UIE Outside Threshold |
|  | Generation with Self Schedule | N/A | N/A | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SRE + RED } \\ & + \text { RIE + UIE } \end{aligned}$ | Gross Ramp Outside Threshold |
|  | Dynamic Transfers | Instruction | 10 Minute Meter | UIE1 + UIE2 | Gross UIE Outside Threshold |
| 3 | Fixed Ramp Interties \& SelfSchedules | Ramp Modeled | Assumed Delivered | Net Movement | Gross by SC |

No netting across settlement intervals.

Expectation of relative cost of flexible ramping up versus flexible ramping down


A resource following load should see lower relative cost allocation if deviation/movement in direction of load pull

## Next Steps

| Item | Date |
| :--- | :--- |
| Stakeholder Technical Workshop | September 18, 2012 |
| Stakeholder Comments Due | September 24, 2012 |
| Post 2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ Revised Draft Final Proposal | September 26, 2012 |
| Stakeholder Call | October 2, 2012 |
| Stakeholder Comments Due | October 9, 2012 |
| Board of Governors Meeting | November 1-2, 2012 |

## Submit written comments to FRP@caiso.com

Product design: Lin Xu lxu@caiso.com 916-608-7054

Cost Allocation: Don Tretheway dtretheway@caiso.com 916-608-5995

