

# CAISO Straw Proposal for CRR Credit Policy

Shucheng Liu Principal Market Developer

Stakeholder Conference Call May 4, 2007



# **Topics**

- Credit requirement for participating in CRR allocation and auction
- Credit requirement for holding CRR
- Long-Term CRR credit requirement
- Compliance measures
- Market monitoring and mitigation
- Examples of CRR credit requirement
- Next steps



#### Credit Requirement to Participate in CRR Allocation

- CAISO will require no advance credit deposit to participate in CRR allocation
- However, holder of the CRRs allocated will be subject to credit requirements



# Credit Requirement to Participate in CRR Auction

#### Bidding for positively priced CRRs:

- Credit deposit sufficient to cover bids
- No credit margin needed during auction

#### Bidding for negatively priced CRRs

- No credit requirement to participate
- No payment to auction winners until credit requirements for holding the CRRs are in place
- CRRs will be paid at the conclusion of the auction



#### **Credit Requirement to Hold CRR**

- Same credit requirement criteria apply to all CRR holders
- Overall credit requirement is assessed for the whole portfolio of CRRs of each holder
  - An option to consider: assessing credit requirements for each individual CRR, i.e. no netting. (will discuss later)



# **Two Components of CRR Credit Requirement**

#### CRR expected value

- Credit coverage for the negative auction price of a CRR paid to the holder
- A deterministic value determined in the auction process

#### Credit margin

- Credit coverage that recognizes the potentially volatile nature of the CRR
- A percentile value determined on the probability distribution of the value of the CRR



## **Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement**

 Credit requirement of a CRR with a term of 1 year or less

*Credit Requirement* = -*CRR Expected Value* + *Credit Margin* 

Credit Margin = CRR Expected Value – 5th Percentile CRR Value

That is

*Credit Requirement* = -5th Percentile CRR Value



#### Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement – Low Positive Expected CRR Value





# Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement – High Positive Expected CRR Value





## Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement – Negative Expected CRR Value





## Factors to Consider in Deciding Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement

- Options: also consider 2.5<sup>th</sup> and 1<sup>st</sup> percentile values
- Criteria: a balance between financial requirements and risk tolerance
  - Too low requirements may increase financial risk
    - As CRRs are settled with other market charges, a payment default by the holder could create a shortfall that would affect all net creditors in the month of settlement.
  - Too high requirements may discourage participation and reduce liquidity and effectiveness of the CRR market



#### Calculation of Short-Term CRR Credit Requirements

- Credit requirement for each CRR will be calculated
- Based on the CAISO LMP study data for the first year
- Actual historical LMP data will be used in the future
- Other ISO data will be used as references



#### Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement – Examples

CRR	А	В	С	D	Portfolio			
Statistics								
Expected Value	-6,807	-13,556	21,298	316				
1 Percentile	-8,281	-19,786	19,919	-290				
2.5 Percentile	-7,723	-16,385	20,050	-63				
5 Percentile	-7,235	-15,162	20,076	296				
Credit Margin (\$/MW-Year)								
1 Percentile	1,473	6,230	1,379	606				
2.5 Percentile	916	2,829	1,248	379				
5 Percentile	428	1,605	1,222	20				
Credit Requirement (\$/MW-Year)								
1 Percentile	8,281	19,786	-19,919	290	8,438			
2.5 Percentile	7,723	16,385	-20,050	63	4,121			
5 Percentile	7,235	15,162	-20,076	-296	2,025			



# Four Options Proposed for Determining Long-Term CRR Credit Requirement

Option 1:

*n*\*(-1 year CRR Expected Value + 1 year Credit Margin)

Option 2:

 $n^{*}(-1 \text{ year CRR Expected Value}) + \sqrt{n^{*}(1 \text{ year Credit Margin})}$ 

Option 3:

-1 year CRR Expected Value + 1 year Credit Margin

Option 4:

n\*(-1 year CRR Expected Value)+1 year Credit Margin





# Factors to Consider in Deciding Long-Term CRR Credit Requirement

#### Of the four options:

- Option 1 is the most conservative, and Option 3 is the least
- The CAISO has preference toward Option 2 or 4
- Criteria: a balance between financial requirements and risk tolerance
  - Too low requirements may increase financial risk
  - Too high requirements may discourage participation and reduce liquidity and effectiveness of CRR market





# Long-Term CRR Credit Requirement – Examples (\$/MW)

CRR	А	В	С	D	Portfolio			
Statistics								
1-Year Expected Value	-6,807	-13,556	21,298	316	1,251			
<b>Option 1:</b> <i>n</i> *( <i>-1 year CRR Expected Value + 1 year Credit Margin</i> )								
1 Percentile	82,809	197,861	-199,194	2,901	84,377			
2.5 Percentile	77,231	163,854	-200,501	626	41,209			
5 Percentile	72,347	151,619	-200,761	-2,957	20,249			
<b>Option 2:</b> $n*(-1 \text{ year CRR Ex})$	epected Value) +	$\sqrt{n}$ *(1 year Cred	it Margin)					
1 Percentile	72,734	155,264	-208,624	-1,243	18,131			
2.5 Percentile	70,970	144,510	-209,037	-1,963	4,480			
5 Percentile	69,421	140,641	-209,119	-3,096	0			
<b>Option 3:</b> <i>– 1 yearCRRExpect</i>	ted Value + 1 year	rCreditMargin						
1 Percentile	8,281	19,786	-19,919	290	8,438			
2.5 Percentile	7,723	16,385	-20,050	63	4,121			
5 Percentile	7,235	15,162	-20,076	-296	2,025			
<b>Option 4:</b> $n*(-1 \text{ year CRR Expected Value}) + 1 \text{ year Credit Margin}$								
1 Percentile	69,548	141,794	-211,605	-2,554	0			
2.5 Percentile	68,990	138,393	-211,736	-2,781	0			
5 Percentile	68,497	137,170	-211,762	-3,140	0			



#### Long-Term CRR Credit Requirement Adjustment

- Adjust no less than annually
- Account for change in remaining terms
- Reflect changes of CRR ownership
- Update expected value and credit margin based on actual market operation data



## Additional Credit Requirements for LT-CRRs Held by External LSEs

- Maintain one year credit coverage for WAC prepayment
  - One year of WAC commitment is added to the EAL
  - No need to post additional credit as long as ACL is greater than EAL including WAC prepayment
  - Entities would then prepay the WAC on a monthly basis
  - Consistent with FERC April 20 Order



#### Compliance Measures for Failure to Meet Credit Requirements

- Terminate all CRR agreements with the default holder
- Retain all payments due to the CRRs and resell the CRRs in subsequent auctions
- Retain financial security sufficient to cover default
- Exclude the holder from future CRR allocation and auctions
- Prohibit the holder from subsequently acquiring CRRs



# Market Monitoring and Mitigation Measures

- FERC and CAISO market rules prohibit Market Manipulation
- CAISO DMM will monitor unusual activities in CRR allocation and auction processes
- For misconduct, the CAISO will
  - Require disclosure of affiliations
  - Explicitly warn participants
  - Refer to FERC



# Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement without Credit Offset (i.e. no netting)

 Credit requirements assessed for each individual CRR in a portfolio separately

Credit Margin:

Credit Margin = CRR Expected Value – 5th Percentile CRR Value

**Credit Requirement** 

Credit Requirement = max(0, -5th Percentile CRR Value)



#### Four Options for L-T CRR Credit Requirement without Credit Offset

Option 1:

*n*\* max(0, – 1 year CRR Expected Value + 1 year Credit Margin)

Option 2:

 $n * \max(0, -1 \text{ year CRR Expected Value}) + \sqrt{n^*(1 \text{ year Credit Margin})}$ 

Option 3:

max(0,-1 year CRR Expected Value + 1 year Credit Margin)

Option 4:

*n*\*max(0,-1 year CRR Expected Value)+1 year Credit Margin



#### Short-Term CRR Credit Requirement without Offset – Examples

CRR	А	В	С	D	Portfolio
Statistics					
Expected Value	-6,807	-13,556	21,298	316	
1 Percentile	-8,281	-19,786	19,919	-290	
2.5 Percentile	-7,723	-16,385	20,050	-63	
5 Percentile	-7,235	-15,162	20,076	296	
Credit Margin					
1 Percentile	1,473	6,230	1,379	606	
2.5 Percentile	916	2,829	1,248	379	
5 Percentile	428	1,605	1,222	20	
Credit Requirement					
1 Percentile	8,281	19,786	0	290	28,357
2.5 Percentile	7,723	16,385	0	63	24,171
5 Percentile	7,235	15,162	0	0	22,397





# LT-CRR Credit Requirement without Offset – Examples (\$/MW)

CRR	А	В	С	D	Portfolio			
Statistics								
1-Year Expected Value	-6,807	-13,556	21,298	316	3,251			
<b>Option 1:</b> $n*\max(0,-1 \text{ year CRR Expected Value }+1 \text{ year Credit Margin})$								
1 Percentile	82,809	197,861	0	2,901	283,571			
2.5 Percentile	77,231	163,854	0	626	241,710			
5 Percentile	72,347	151,619	0	0	223,966			
<b>Option 2:</b> $n * \max(0, -1 \text{ year CRR Expected Value}) + \sqrt{n} * (1 \text{ year Credit Margin})$								
1 Percentile	72,734	155,264	4,361	1,917	234,276			
2.5 Percentile	70,970	144,510	3,948	1,197	220,625			
5 Percentile	69,421	140,641	3,866	64	213,992			
<b>Option 3:</b> max(0, -1 year CRF	Expected Value	+1 yearCreditM	(argin)					
1 Percentile	8,281	19,786	0	290	28,357			
2.5 Percentile	7,723	16,385	0	63	24,171			
5 Percentile	7,235	15,162	0	0	22,397			
<b>Option 4:</b> $n * \max(0, -1 \text{ year CRR Expected Value}) + 1 \text{ year Credit Margin}$								
1 Percentile	69,548	141,794	1,379	606	213,327			
2.5 Percentile	68,990	138,393	1,248	379	209,010			
5 Percentile	68,497	137,170	1,222	20	206,909			



# ST-CRR Credit Requirement Comparison – With and without Credit Offset

CRR	А	В	С	D	Portfolio		
Credit Margin (\$/MW-Year)							
1 Percentile	1,473	6,230	1,379	606			
2.5 Percentile	916	2,829	1,248	379			
5 Percentile	428	1,605	1,222	20			
Credit Requirement (\$/MW-Year, with Credit Offset)							
1 Percentile	8,281	19,786	-19,919	290	8,438		
2.5 Percentile	7,723	16,385	-20,050	63	4,121		
5 Percentile	7,235	15,162	-20,076	-296	2,025		
Credit Requirement (\$/MW-Year, without Credit Offset)							
1 Percentile	8,281	19,786	0	290	28,357		
2.5 Percentile	7,723	16,385	0	63	24,171		
5 Percentile	7,235	15,162	0	0	22,397		



# LT-CRR Credit Requirement Comparison – With and without Credit Offset

(\$/MW)	With Credit Offset			Witho	out Credit (	Offset
CRR	С	D	Portfolio	С	D	Portfolio
Option 1						
1 Percentile	-199,194	2,901	84,377	0	2,901	283,571
2.5 Percentile	-200,501	626	41,209	0	626	241,710
5 Percentile	-200,761	-2,957	20,249	0	0	223,966
Option 2						
1 Percentile	-208,624	-1,243	18,131	4,361	1,917	234,276
2.5 Percentile	-209,037	-1,963	4,480	3,948	1,197	220,625
5 Percentile	-209,119	-3,096	0	3,866	64	213,992
Option 3						
1 Percentile	-19,919	290	8,438	0	290	28,357
2.5 Percentile	-20,050	63	4,121	0	63	24,171
5 Percentile	-20,076	-296	2,025	0	0	22,397
Option 4						
1 Percentile	-211,605	-2,554	0	1,379	606	213,327
2.5 Percentile	-211,736	-2,781	0	1,248	379	209,010
5 Percentile	-211,762	-3,140	0	1,222	20	206,909



# **Next Steps**

- Stakeholder written comments requested by May 11 (<u>CRRComments@caiso.com</u>)
- Second stakeholder conference call to discuss final policy proposal in mid May
- Presentation to the CAISO Board for decision in late May
- FERC filing in early June